Mental Health Tribunal for Scotland Administration

Report on the 2008/09 Audit

18 December 2009







Mental Health Tribunal for Scotland Administration

Report on the 2008/09 Audit

Contents

Key	messages	
-----	----------	--

- Introduction
- Financial Statements
- Use of Resources

1	Governance and	
3	Accountability	10
4	Performance	13
7	Looking Forward	16
-	Appendix A: Action Plan	17



Key messages

In 2008/09 we looked at the key strategic and financial risks being faced by the Mental Health Tribunal for Scotland Administration (MHTSA) and audited the financial statements. This is the final annual report for MHTSA as it is being incorporated into the Justice Department of the Scottish Government from 2009/10. This report sets out our key findings.

Financial statements

We have given an unqualified opinion on the financial statements of the MHTSA for 2008/09. We have also concluded that in all material respects, the expenditure and receipts shown in the financial statements were incurred or applied in accordance with applicable enactments and relevant guidance, issued by Scottish Ministers.

Financial position and use of resources

During 2008/09, the MHTSA incurred expenditure of £10.47 million, resulting in an overspend of £0.97 million against the budget allocation of £9.5 million. This overspend is partly attributable to the number of tribunals being held during the year being higher than expected.

The budget for the 2009/10 activity of the merged function has been agreed as £9.75 million. This will be very challenging to achieve and will require robust budgetary control measures to be adopted.

As with all public sector bodies in Scotland, a level of efficiency savings was required during 2008/09, however, the MHTSA failed to develop a detailed approach to ensuring delivery of these required savings. No robust approach was established to identify and monitor progress towards the efficiency savings throughout the year. An improved approach for identifying savings is required, along with routine monitoring of progress to ensure that future efficiencies are achieved.

Governance and accountability

Corporate governance is concerned with the structures and processes for decision making, accountability, control and behaviour at the upper levels of an organisation. Overall, the corporate governance and control arrangements for the MHTSA operated satisfactorily during the year, as reflected in the Statement on Internal Control.

We examined the key financial systems which underpin the organisation's control environment. We concluded that financial systems and procedures operated sufficiently well to enable us to place reliance on them.

The Auditor General for Scotland has issued a report under Section 22 of the Public Finance and Accountability (Scotland) Act 2000 in respect of the costs associated with the resignation of the former president of the Mental Health Tribunal.



Performance

The MHTSA has developed a number of key performance targets including that 35% of hearings are to be held on a two-per-day basis, and 99% of Compulsory Treatment Orders are to take place within statutory time limits. The number of hearings "doubled up" during 2008/09 was 42.4% and 98.9% of Compulsory Treatment Orders took place within statutory time limits. The MHTSA is currently performing significantly below its target of issuing records of the findings and facts of 80% of cases within 10 days. The performance against this target for 2008/09 was 67.4%.

The Business Plan for 2009/10 remains in draft format and is currently being reviewed prior to finalisation. The Plan focuses on seven key objectives including managing the financial affairs of the MHTSA within Scottish Government guidelines and delivering services in line with the agreed budget provision.

Looking forward

The final part of our report notes some key risk areas and issues for the MHTSA going forward. The key challenge is around the establishment of the merged organisation within the Justice Department. But we also highlight a number of national issues which affect all public sector bodies including the National Performance Framework and the introduction of Scotland Performs; the impact of International Financial Reporting Standards; and the review of data handling arrangements in public bodies across Scotland. The organisation also faces significant financial pressure over the next year to remain within budget limits.

The assistance and co-operation given to us by Board members and staff during our audit is gratefully acknowledged.

UDIT SCOTLAND 18 December 2009



Introduction

- 1. This report summarises the findings from our 2008/09 audit of the Mental Health Tribunal for Scotland Administration (MHTSA). The scope of the audit was set out in our Audit Plan, which was presented to the Audit Committee on 28 January 2009. This plan set out our views on the key business risks facing the organisation and described the work we planned to carry out on financial statements, performance and governance.
- 2. Within this report we refer to the key issues identified throughout the year. Appendix A of this report sets out the key risks highlighted in this report and the action planned by management to address them.
- 3. Audit Scotland is moving towards a form of annual report which covers the key areas of Best Value. We have made an early start to this process in our 2008/09 reports. We do not, however, make an overall best value judgement here, partly because we do not have enough evidence to conclude on all relevant areas, but also because of the status of the MHTSA, and its current absorption into the Justice Department. Our intention is to build up the Best Value assessment over time, and in this case, such future judgements will be developed in relation to the wider functions within the Scottish Government.
- 4. One of the building blocks for our assessment of best value is the national study programme carried out by Audit Scotland on behalf of both the Auditor General for Scotland and the Accounts Commission. We mention the key findings from all relevant reports, and the implications for the MHTSA, throughout this report. Full copies of the study reports can be obtained from Audit Scotland's website, <u>www.audit-scotland.gov.uk</u>.
- 5. We would like to take this opportunity to express our appreciation for the assistance and co-operation provided by management and the Board of the MHTSA during the course of our audit. This report will be submitted to the Auditor General for Scotland and will be published on our website.



Financial Statements

6. In this section we summarise key outcomes from our audit of the MHTSA's financial statements for 2008/09 and the accounting issues faced. The financial statements are an essential means by which the organisation accounts for its stewardship of the resources available to it and its financial performance in the use of those resources.

Our responsibilities

- 7. We audit the financial statements and give an opinion on:
 - whether they give a true and fair view of the financial position of MHTSA and its expenditure and income for the period in question
 - whether they were prepared properly in accordance with relevant legislation, applicable accounting standards and other reporting requirements
 - the consistency of the information which comprises the Management Commentary and Operating and Financial Review within the financial statements
 - the regularity of the expenditure and receipts.
- 8. We also review the statement on internal control by:
 - considering the adequacy of the process put in place by the Chief Executive as Accountable
 Officer to obtain assurances on systems of internal control
 - assessing whether disclosures in the statement are consistent with our knowledge of the MHTSA.

Overall conclusion

- 9. We have given an unqualified opinion on the financial statements of the MHTSA for 2008/09.
- 10. An early set of draft accounts were presented to the MHTSA Board on 29 May 2009. This was prior to the agreed date of 8 June 2009 when the unaudited accounts were to be provided to us. At this meeting the Board made a number of comments relating to the clarity of the accounts and a further additional meeting was arranged for the 18 June 2009 for the Board to discuss the changes required to the accounts.
- 11. The fieldwork commenced on 11 June 2009 as agreed, however due to a combination of matters arising in the initial audit work and particularly the timetabling of the meeting for the Board to discuss required changes it was decided that the audit would halt on 15 June 2009 to avoid the MHTSA

incurring additional audit costs and would only re-commence on receipt of a final draft of the unaudited accounts. The audit was able to continue on 24 June 2009 when an updated version of the accounts was received.

12. We concluded our audit and provided our opinion to the Audit Committee on 27 July 2009 as timetabled.

Issues arising from the audit

- 13. As required by auditing standards, we reported to the audit committee on 27 July 2009 the main issues arising from our audit of the financial statements. The key issues were as follows:
- 14. **Contingent liability** Included within the accounts is a contingent liability of £150,000 in respect of a claim being progressed through an Employment Tribunal. The liability has been calculated based on information received from legal advisers. We received written assurances from the MHTSA, in a letter of representation, that the contingent liability in their judgement included all likely amounts payable by the MHTSA in relation to this matter.
- 15. President's pension provisions Provisions totalling £366,000 are included in the financial statements in respect of pensions payable to the past President and the current President. These amounts have been notified to the MHTSA by the Scottish Government Actuarial section. We requested and received written assurance that the provisions contained within the 2008/09 accounts reflects the amounts due and payable by the MHTSA and exclude any contributions to be made by the past or present Presidents.

Regularity

16. The Public Finance and Accountability (Scotland) Act 2000 imposes a responsibility on auditors that requires us to certify that, in all material respects, the expenditure and receipts shown in the accounts were incurred or applied in accordance with applicable enactments and guidance issued by the Scottish Ministers. We have been able to address the requirements of the regularity assertion through a range of procedures, including written assurances from the Accountable Officer as to her view on adherence to enactments and guidance.

International financial reporting standards (IFRS)

17. As announced by the Chancellor in the 2008 Budget report on 12 March 2008 (Budget report paragraph C103), Government departments and other public sector bodies will report using International Financial Reporting Standards (IFRS) from 2009/10. The Scottish Government announced on 25 April 2008 that all Scottish Government Departments, Executive Agencies, health



bodies and non-departmental public bodies would be required to produce shadow IFRS based accounts for financial year 2008/09. This was to include a restated balance sheet as at 1 April 2008. However, given the MHTSA's transfer to the core Scottish Government, this detailed requirement need not apply in this case. Nevertheless, appropriate adjustments will require to be made to MHTSA's 2008/09 accounts to allow appropriate consolidation into the 2009/10 accounts of the Scottish Government.

Risk area 1



Use of Resources

- 18. Sound management and use of resources (people, money and assets) to deliver strategic objectives is a key feature of best value. This section sets out our main findings from a review of MHTSA
 - financial position
 - financial management.

Financial Position

Outturn 2008/09

- 19. The MHTSA incurred costs of £10.47 million in the year ended 31 March 2009. The financial allocation was £9.5 million, giving rise to an overspend of £0.97 million. (2007/08 £1.773 million overspend). As in prior years, the overspend is partly attributable to a higher than expected number of tribunals held during the year.
- 20. From the budget setting process at the start of 2008/09, prior to the final budget allocation notification being received, the MHTSA was aware that efficiency savings would be required during the year. The budget allocation further emphasised this position. However, the MHTSA failed to establish a robust budgetary control system to monitor the costs being incurred across the organisation and identify areas where efficiencies could be obtained.
- 21. Financial updates were provided to each Board meeting and discussions took place on the financial position of the organisation. However, there is scope for the organisation to take more action to find new efficiency savings during the year to allow the organisation to achieve year end financial balance.

Risk area 2

Financial sustainability and the 2009/10 budget

- 22. The MHTSA is transferring from its agency status (sponsored by the Scottish Government Health Directorates) into the Justice Directorate. The budget for 2009/10 has been agreed as £9.75 million. The new business unit will find it very challenging to achieve financial balance, particularly considering expenditure during 2007/08 and 2008/09 was above this level.
- 23. To address the continual overspends and to attempt to achieve a balanced budget in 2009/10, it is planned that the scheduling of hearings will become more efficient. It is intended that an increased number of tribunals will hear more than one case per day. It is also envisaged that the doubling up of tribunals will allow for reductions in other cost areas including the administration costs incurred in organising a tribunal.



National Studies

24. Audit Scotland published two national studies relevant to the MHTSA's use of resources. These were the use of consultancy services and improving energy efficiency.

Use of consultancy services

- 25. The overall aim of the study was to review central government's use of consultancy services and to make recommendations to improve the public sector's use of consultants' knowledge, skills and resources to help deliver new services and initiatives quickly and expertly. The key findings were as follows:
 - The public sector is strengthening the way it buys goods and services.
 - Central government does not have a clear strategy for its use of consultants or for linking use to its priorities or financial and workforce plans.
 - In most cases, central government buys consultancy services well but some improvements can be made.
 - Central government could improve how it manages consultancy projects through more consistent and formal evaluation of consultants' work and learning more from them.
 - Central government could make savings of up to £13 million a year through better planning and buying of consultancy services.
- 26. The report made specific recommendations for public bodies:
 - confirm that they have clear processes for approving and recording the use of consultants and monitoring progress, and reinforce these as required
 - plan the use of consultancy services when developing forward work programmes to ensure that consultants are used where their knowledge and skills bring greatest value for money
 - to always evaluate the option to use consultants against the option to use their own staff
 - to gather and share consistent information on the consultancy skills bought and why consultants are used
 - to improve the quality of invitations to tender through better and earlier discussion with consultants about their consultancy needs
 - to increase the use of framework agreements where possible by ensuring that existing agreements are used and new ones developed as appropriate
 - to select and use the most economical competition routes by using framework agreements, restricted competitions and closed tendering approaches when appropriate



- to evaluate the work of consultants more systematically and share findings from these reviews
- to work closely with consultants to increase assurance on quality and make use of opportunities to learn from consultants and ensure knowledge transfer, where appropriate.

Improving energy efficiency

- 27. Audit Scotland assessed how councils, NHS bodies and central government bodies were improving energy efficiency in relation to buildings and transport use. This included examination of a range of issues including whether public bodies demonstrate commitment to improving energy efficiency; how public bodies are performing against their objectives and targets for improving energy efficiency; and whether public bodies are delivering continuous improvement in this area. The main issues were:-
 - Funding has been made available by the Scottish Government to public bodies to improve energy efficiency. While energy consumption in buildings has fallen, spending on energy increased in the three years to 2006/07.
 - There is a need for stronger leadership by the Scottish Government and within public bodies to improve energy efficiency and ensure that the necessary cultural and behavioural changes are made.
 - A robust strategy is central to the coordination of activities to improve energy efficiency, however, there are inconsistencies in the quality of strategies being implemented.
 - There is a lack of formal monitoring and reporting of progress in improving energy efficiency by public bodies and the Scottish Government.



Governance and Accountability

- 28. High standards of governance and accountability, with effective structures and processes to govern decision-making and balanced reporting of performance to the public, are fundamental features of best value. This section sets out our findings arising from a review of the MHTSA arrangements.
- 29. Increasingly services are being delivered across the public sector through partnership working, sometimes involving complex governance and accountability arrangements. Best value characteristics also include effective partnership working to deliver sustained improvements in outcomes.

Overview of arrangements

- 30. This year we reviewed:
 - key systems of internal control
 - matters relating to the resignation of the former President of the Mental Health Tribunal
 - arrangements for the prevention and detection of fraud and irregularity, including standards of conduct.
- 31. Our overall conclusion is that arrangements within the MHTSA are sound and have operated through 2008/09.

Systems of internal control

- 32. Key controls within systems should operate effectively and efficiently to accurately record financial transactions and prevent and detect fraud or error. This should support a robust internal control environment and the effective production of financial statements. In their annual report for 2008/09 Chiene & Tait, the internal auditors, provided their opinion that, based on the internal audit work undertaken during the year, "management has limited assurance that the internal controls and governance frameworks which it operates are sufficient to ensure the efficient and effective operation of the organisation and that the strategic and operational risks to which the organisation is exposed are being managed".
- 33. As part of our audit we reviewed the high level controls in a number of MHTSA systems that impact on the financial statements. Our overall conclusion was that these key controls were operating effectively and that the MHTSA has adequate systems of internal control in place in this regard. We did identify a number of areas where controls could be strengthened and agreed an action plan of improvements with management.



Statement on Internal Control

34. The Statement on Internal Control provided by the MHTSA's Accountable Officer reflected the main findings from both external and internal audit work. This recorded management's responsibility for maintaining a sound system of internal control and set out the MHTSA's approach to this. During 2008/09, internal audit undertook reviews on some of the contracts entered into during the year. The report highlighted several areas of weakness and an action plan was agreed with the MHTSA. The Statement on Internal Control makes reference to the existence of reported weaknesses and notes that these will continue to be addressed as the new organisation evolves within the Scottish Government.

Resignation of the former President

- 35. We also considered the arrangements relating to the departure from office in October 2008 of the previous President of the Mental Health Tribunal for Scotland and liaised with the SGHD, the then sponsoring department. The remuneration report in MHTSA's accounts for 2008/09 shows that the former President of the Tribunal resigned from her post as President with effect from October 2008. An Acting President was appointed and paid from 21 November 2007 in the absence of the former President from that time.
- 36. Although the former President was absent from her duties as President from November 2007 she continued to receive her remuneration as President until her resignation took effect in October 2008. Based on the information in the accounts the remuneration during the 11 months absence was between £146,000 and £153,000. In addition, the accounts show that MHTSA has made a provision of £297,000 in respect of the estimated future costs of the former President's pension. This cost arises from the total period of her service prior to her resignation (three years and eight months). Pro rata, some £78,000 of this cost accrued during the absence period.
- 37. The remuneration paid to the former President during her absence was therefore significant. In recognition of this the Auditor General for Scotland has issued report under Section 22 of the Public Finance and Accountability (Scotland) Act 2000, drawing these costs to the Parliament's attention.

Internal Audit

38. The establishment and operation of an effective internal audit function forms a key element of effective governance and stewardship. The audit committee approved a proposal on 14 July 2008 to extend the 18 month contract of Chiene & Tait as internal auditors for a further two years with the new contract terminating on 30 June 2010. Due to the MHTSA transferring to the Scottish Government Justice Department, the internal audit contract with Chiene & Tait was terminated as of



31 March 2009. Internal audit service is now provided by the Scottish Government Internal Audit Division for 2009/10 onwards.

Prevention and detection of fraud and irregularities

- 39. Within the MHTSA standing financial instructions, arrangements are outlined for the prevention and detection of fraud. The organisation has a policy statement on fraud that details staff responsibilities relating to the use of public resources and the body's approach to fraud including its commitment to the system of internal controls.
- 40. Further developments in this area are still required as outlined in the standing financial instructions. These include the MHTSA establishing a formal relationship with NHS National Services Scotland Counter Fraud Services and developing a full fraud response plan for the organisation to follow.



Performance

- 41. Public audit is more wide-ranging than in the private sector and covers the examination of, and reporting on, performance and value for money issues. Key features of best value include:
 - setting a clear vision of what the organisation wants to achieve, backed up by plans and strategies to secure improvement, with resources aligned to support their delivery
 - a performance management culture which is embedded throughout the organisation and a performance management framework which is comprehensive and supports the delivery of improved outcomes.
- 42. In this section we comment on:
 - MHTSA business plan
 - performance against targets
 - performance management arrangements.

Vision and strategic direction

- 43. The MHTSA has a draft business plan which focuses on operational aspects and the contribution that the MHTSA will make to the National Performance Framework. The business plan focuses on a range of corporate objectives including:
 - ensuring members are equipped with the knowledge and facilities to be able to deliver responsive judicial decision making
 - recruiting, maintaining and retaining a high performing administrative workforce
 - operating the Tribunal in line with Scottish Government standards for good governance of public bodies.
- 44. Within each area the MHTSA has set proposed key actions along with timescales. The MHTSA will have to keep targets under review to ensure achievement of key actions. The delivery of the business plan objectives will be particularly challenging given the tight financial constraints over the same period. It is essential that the MHTSA keeps progress against these targets under review.

Performance overview

45. The Mental Health (Care and Treatment)(Scotland) Act 2003 places tight timescales on the holding of hearings when Compulsory Treatment Orders (CTOs) are made and the Tribunal must hold a first hearing within five working days of the expiry of a Short Term Detention Certificate (STDC). The most



recent data published on the MHTSA website relating to the quarter ended March 2009, indicates that applications appear to be arriving later than previously. This means that the MHTSA has less time available to arrange hearings and there is, therefore, an increased risk that the statutory timescales will not be met.

Risk area 3

- 46. The MHTSA publishes quarterly statistics including numbers of new cases, application attributes, numbers of hearings, administration information and activity by local authority population. Within our 2008/09 Audit Plan we highlighted that there is scope for the MHTSA to develop current key performance indicators to ensure they are relevant to the organisation. The indicators were reviewed and updated and regular monitoring and reporting against these was undertaken during the year.
- 47. As at August 2009, the most recent performance data included on the website related to the quarter ended 31 March 2009. The timeous reporting of performance information is an essential step towards improving service delivery. Throughout the year the Board has received routine updates on the organisation's progress towards achieving the Key Performance Targets.

Risk management

- 48. There are a number of key challenges and risks for the organisation in delivering its core functions. The organisation has put in place a system for the identification and management of risk with the adoption of a single corporate risk register. The register is updated on a regular basis to ensure that it includes all current risks and that arrangements are in place for the register to be presented to the Board for discussion.
- 49. The main risk areas are:
 - Securing Financial Stability As has been noted elsewhere in this report, one of the significant challenges that the MHTSA faces relates to its ability to operate within its funding allocation. Greater accountability is required in relation to the organisation's approach and commitment to achieving efficiency savings to ensure that year end financial balance is realised. This issue remains a significant challenge for the MHTSA, including in its new status within the Scottish Government.
 - Long term transition arrangements As at 1 April 2009, the MHTSA transferred into the Scottish Government Justice Department. All future costs will be included within the Justice and Communities operating cost statement. It is unclear what long term organisational changes will be required as a result of this transfer, however changes must be clearly communicated and plans established to manage the transition.



- Management Capacity / Workforce Development The organisation experienced significant staff turnover during 2008/09. This can lead to skill shortages, under-qualified staff in key roles or increases to staff workload which can adversely affect the performance and capabilities of the organisation and lead to increased pressure and reduced staff morale. Actions require to be taken to address this issue to ensure that the organisation continues to operate as required.
- 50. These risk areas are complex and comprise multiple issues which will require careful management to resolve. We have continued to monitor the MHTSA's progress in each of these areas over the course of the year.

Efficiency

- 51. The MHTSA was required to make efficiency savings during 2008/09. Forecast expenditure for the year was greater than the budget allocation and, on notification of this, the organisation should have reviewed the annual budget and considered areas to reduce expenditure.
- 52. The MHTSA faces a number of risks in achieving financial balance including:
 - uncertainty and lack of control around the number of tribunals required
 - uncertainty of financial costs surrounding the appointment of the new position of 'curator ad litem'.
- 53. The efficiency savings required during 2008/09 were not quantified and the organisation failed to develop a robust approach to identifying and monitoring savings. Papers were not presented to the Board outlining the level of savings required, how these would be achieved or the subsequent progress in realising them.
- 54. Monthly finance reports presented to the Board were not analysed to identify savings. Expenditure was not routinely scrutinised to determine underlying reasons for overspends against budget. The organisation will not be able to address their continual pattern of overspending if scrutiny of expenditure against budget is not undertaken. Continual monitoring and scrutiny of the organisation's financial position is required to ensure that the organisation is able to achieve year end financial balance and can end its trend of overspending.

Risk area 4



Looking Forward

- 55. The MHTSA faces a number of challenges in 2009/10, which include:
 - Transfer to Justice Directorate The MHTSA transferred to the Scottish Government Justice Directorate as at 1 April 2009. It is unclear what long term organisational changes will be required as a result of this transfer, however, changes must be clearly communicated and plans established to manage the transition.
 - Financial management and affordability The 2009/10 budget has been agreed as £9.75 million. The organisation will find it very challenging to achieve financial balance based on the trend of overspends experienced in prior years. The organisation will need to make efficiency savings during 2009-10. To successfully achieve these savings, a robust and detailed approach will need to be established for the identification and future monitoring of progress towards these targets.
 - National Performance Framework The Scottish Government is continuing to develop its approach to performance management based on the National Performance Framework and local authority single outcome agreements. The National Performance Framework is an outcome-based approach that is publically reported on the Scottish Government's website in the 'Virginia-style' model of performance measurement and reporting. This will include progress on overall delivery of the administration's purpose for Government, the five strategic objectives for Scotland and other aspects of the outcomes based National Performance Framework.
 - Efficiencies and future funding Budgets for 2009-10 and the immediate future will need to be managed within a tighter funding regime. This includes no scope for the application of end of year flexibility for the Government with HM Treasury until the next Spending Review; no option to transfer funds from capital to revenue; and the impact of the introduction of International Financial Reporting Standards (IFRS). The organisation will be required to achieve efficiency savings over the next three years to achieve financial balance. The challenge for the organisation is to prioritise spending, identify efficiencies and review future commitments to ensure delivery of key targets and objectives.



Appendix A: Action Plan

Key Risk Areas and Planned Management Action

Action Point	Risk Identified	Planned Action	Responsible Officer	Target Date
1	Substantial work will be required from Finance Staff to prepare IFRS adjustments for the Scottish Government's 2009/10 accounts.	These adjustments have been completed.	Head of Finance	n/a
2	There is a risk that the organisation may not achieve year end financial balance if a robust budgetary control system is not in place.	A more robust system of budgetary control is now in place incorporating fixed and variable costs.	Head of Finance	31/3/10
3	There is a risk that, if the trend of later receipt of applications as disclosed on the MHTSA website for the quarter ended 31 March 2009 continues, statutory deadlines may not be achieved.	Statutory deadlines are achieved in 99% of cases and we hold regular stakeholder engagements to promote prompt submission of applications which will reduce slippage even further.	Senior Casework Manager	Ongoing
4	To ensure financial year end balance, the MHTSA is required to deliver efficiency savings. Failure to achieve these savings may present a risk to the delivery of services.	MHTSA are aware of the need to generate efficiency savings and steps are being taken to implement these savings.	Head of Administration	2009-10 and beyond