



**ANNUAL REPORT TO THE BOARD OF  
GOVERNORS, THE AUDITOR GENERAL FOR  
SCOTLAND AND THE SCOTTISH GOVERNMENT  
ON THE EXTERNAL AUDIT FOR THE YEAR ENDED  
31 JULY 2016**

Topic	Date
Commencement of final visit	5 October 2016
Audit clearance meeting	2 November 2016
Presentation to Audit Committee	1 December 2016
Proposed presentation to Board of Governors	13 December 2016

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

SECTION	PAGE
1 EXECUTIVE SUMMARY .....	3
2 INTRODUCTION.....	5
3 FINANCIAL REVIEW .....	7
4 AUDIT APPROACH & KEY FINDINGS .....	13
5 GOVERNANCE & INTERNAL CONTROLS .....	16
6 FRAUD AND IRREGULARITIES.....	18
7 AUDIT RECOMMENDATIONS – 31 JULY 2015 .....	19
8 AUDIT RECOMMENDATIONS – CURRENT PERIOD .....	21
<b>APPENDICES</b>	<b>PAGE</b>
A BOARD OF GOVERNORS’ RESPONSIBILITIES .....	24
B INDEPENDENT AUDITOR’S REPORT .....	26
C LETTER OF REPRESENTATION .....	29
D IDENTIFIED AUDIT RISKS, APPROACH AND CONCLUSION .....	32
E CONTACT DETAILS.....	34

### Disclaimer

This report has been prepared for the purposes of the College Management, Board and the Auditor General for Scotland and should not be issued to third parties without our prior written consent. We would emphasise that our comments in this report are not intended to be any reflection on the integrity of the College staff whom we would like to thank for their help and assistance throughout our audit visit. Should you have any queries on the contents of the Annual Report please do not hesitate to contact us.

## **1 EXECUTIVE SUMMARY**

### **1.1 FINANCIAL REVIEW**

The college returned a deficit of £595k for the 12 months ending 31 July 2016. The comparative result for 16-month period ended 31 July 2015 was a deficit of £205k (restated). After accounting for actuarial losses of £1,296k (2015: £18k) in respect of the pension schemes the college is reporting total comprehensive expenditure of £1,891k (2015: income of £4,375k as restated). The prior year surplus is due to a gain on revaluation of fixed assets of £4,598k. The college has however achieved an operating surplus for the year, as detailed in section 3.8, of £230k (2015: 554k).

The College has a net liability position of £7,701k (2015: £5,810k restated), however this liability position is due to the new requirement to show deferred capital grants within liabilities as introduced by FRS102 and the new FE/HE SORP. Deferred capital grants at 31 July 2016 totalled £15,711k (2015: £16,291k). The decrease in the net asset position is principally due to the increase in the pension liability at the year end.

For the year ended 31 July 2017, the College has predicted a surplus of £157,000 within its annual budget.

### **1.2 FINANCIAL STATEMENTS & GOING CONCERN**

We have issued an unqualified opinion on the accounts of West Lothian College for the period ended 31 July 2016. In light of the College's net liability position, we have reviewed the Board of Governor's assessment of the College's ability to continue as a going concern. The College's forecasts and financial projections indicate that the College has a reasonable expectation that it has adequate resources to continue in operational existence for the foreseeable future, and for this reason will continue to adopt the going concern basis in the preparation of its Financial Statements. As auditors we are satisfied following review of the forecasts and financial projections that the Board of Governor's assessment of the going concern basis of preparation is appropriate.

### **1.3 GOVERNANCE & INTERNAL CONTROL**

We have undertaken an overall review of the corporate governance arrangements and processes of internal control in place at the College. Based on the audit work undertaken and the findings made by the internal auditors the College has adequate systems in place to comply with corporate governance requirements.

**1.4 REGULARITY**

We have issued an unqualified regularity opinion. There are no significant issues that we wish to draw to the Board's attention in this regard.

**1.5 ACCOUNTABILITY REPORT**

The College is required to include an Accountability Report within its annual report and accounts in accordance with the SFC Accounts Direction. Included within this is a Remuneration and Staff Report. We have undertaken appropriate audit work as part of our engagement and have issued an unqualified audit opinion in respect of the auditable areas of the Remuneration & Staff Report.

**1.6 RECOMMENDATIONS TO MANAGEMENT**

We have made no new recommendations in the year. The only outstanding recommendation from the audit in the period to 31 July 2015 has been cleared during the year.

## 2 INTRODUCTION

### 2.1 APPOINTMENT

Wylie & Bisset LLP were appointed as the External Auditors of West Lothian College with effect from 1 August 2011 for a period of 5 years (until 31 July 2016).

### 2.2 RESPECTIVE RESPONSIBILITIES

Our audit has been carried out in accordance with our statutory responsibilities, statements of auditing standards and wider responsibilities contained in the Code of Audit Practice (the 'Code') issued by Audit Scotland in May 2011. The 'Code' states that the auditor's objectives are to:

- Provide an opinion on the College's financial statements and, the regularity of transactions;
- Review and report on other information published in the financial statements, including the annual governance statement, statement of internal control and remuneration report;
- Review and report on the College's corporate governance arrangements as they relate to:
  - The College's review of its systems of internal control
  - The prevention and detection of fraud and irregularity
  - Standards of conduct, and the prevention and detection of corruption
  - Its financial position,
- Review aspects of the College's arrangements to manage its performance and achieve Best Value.

The responsibilities of the Board of Governors with regard to the financial statements are set out in the “Statement of Responsibilities of the Board of Governors” included in Appendix A and in the “Independent Auditors’ Report” in Appendix B.

The responsibilities of Wylie & Bisset LLP with regard to the financial statements and our audit opinion on the financial statements are included in the “Independent Auditors’ Report” included in Appendix B.

### **2.3 REPORTING**

Our audit work has been designed to enable us to form an audit opinion on the financial statements of the college and should not be relied upon to disclose all weaknesses in internal controls in relation to the college’s systems and financial statements.

This Annual Report has been prepared for the purposes of the College’s management and Governors and should not be issued to third parties without our prior written consent. We would emphasise that our comments in this report are not intended to be any reflection on the integrity of the College whom we would like to thank for their help and assistance throughout our audit visit.

Should you have any queries on the contents of the Annual Report please do not hesitate to contact us.

### **3 FINANCIAL REVIEW**

#### **3.1 FINANCIAL STATEMENTS**

The financial statements of the College are the means by which it accounts for its stewardship of the resources made available to it and its financial performance in the use of these resources. In accordance with the Further and Higher Education (Scotland) Act 1992 and the Accounts Direction issued by the SFC, it is the responsibility of the College to prepare financial statements, which give a true and fair view of the College's financial position and the income and expenditure for the year. The Accounts Direction requires compliance with the Statement of Recommended Practice: Accounting for Further and Higher Education 2015 ("the SORP").

The Public Finance and Accountability (Scotland) Act 2000 requires that the auditor shall place on the abstract of accounts an audit report, which contains an opinion as to whether the College has fulfilled this responsibility. The format of the audit report directed by the Auditor General for Scotland clarifies the respective responsibilities of management and auditors in relation to the accounts and requires auditors to set out the basis on which they have formed their opinion.

#### **3.2 AUDIT OPINION**

We are pleased to record that there are no qualifications in our audit opinion on the College's accounts for the period ended 31 July 2016, as in our opinion, the financial statements give a true and fair view of the College's financial position and the income and expenditure and have been properly prepared in accordance with United Kingdom Generally Accepted Accounting Practice and in accordance with the requirements of the Further and Higher Education (Scotland) Act 1992 and directions made thereunder by the Scottish Funding Council, the Charities and Trustee Investment (Scotland) Act 2005, and regulation 14 of The Charities Accounts (Scotland) Regulations 2006. We are satisfied that funds received have been applied for their intended purpose.

#### **3.3 GOING CONCERN**

In light of the College's net liability position, we have reviewed the Board of Governor's assessment of the College's ability to continue as a going concern. The College's forecasts and financial projections indicate that the College has a reasonable expectation that it has adequate resources to continue in operational existence for the foreseeable future, and for this reason will continue to adopt the going concern basis in the preparation of its Financial Statements. As auditors we are satisfied following review of the forecasts and financial projections that the Board of Governor's assessment of the going concern basis of preparation is appropriate.



### **3.4 SUBMISSION OF WORKING PAPERS**

The financial pages of the accounts submitted for audit were complete and included all the relevant financial information. Working papers provided have been of a good standard and queries arising from the audit have all been resolved. Key staff members were available for consultation throughout the audit process.

### 3.5 STATEMENT OF COMPREHENSIVE INCOME AND EXPENDITURE

- Income and expenditure variances are principally due to the change of accounting period from 16 months to 31 July 2015 to 12 months to 31 July 2016.
- The College was projecting a break-even position and delivered an operating surplus of £40k. A reconciliation of total comprehensive expenditure to operating surplus can be found at section 3.8.
- Variances in income and expenditure have been reviewed with college management and we are satisfied with explanations given.
- Total comprehensive income in 2014/15 was £4,375k and total comprehensive expenditure in 2015/16 is £1,891k. The principal reasons for the decrease of £6,266k are:
  1. the release of deferred grant funding in respect of the College estate in the prior year of £1,601k; and
  2. the prior year unrealised surplus on revaluation of assets totalling £4,598k.

	Y/E 31/07/16	P/E 31/07/15 restated
	£'000	£'000
<b>Income</b>		
Scottish Funding Council Grants	10,961	16,872
Tuition fees and education contracts	2,725	3,468
Other income	2,098	2,282
Investment income	4	11
	15,788	22,633
<b>Expenditure</b>		
Staff costs	10,630	12,963
Other operating expenses	4,716	7,038
Depreciation	780	855
Exceptional impairment loss	-	1,601
Interest and other finance costs	257	381
	16,383	22,838
<b>Deficit for the period</b>	(595)	(205)
Unrealised surplus on revaluation of assets	-	4,598
Actuarial loss in respect of pension schemes	(1,296)	(18)
<b>Total Comprehensive (Expenditure) / Income for the period</b>	(1,891)	4,375

### 3.6 BALANCE SHEET

- The balance on the income and expenditure reserve can be further broken down as follows:

	<b>£'000</b>
I & E trading activities	(341)
I & E holiday pay provision	(170)
I & E PFI voluntary termination provision	(2,843)
I & E early retirement provision	(3,956)
FRS102 pension reserve deficit	(4,799)
<b>Total I &amp; E reserve deficit</b>	<b>(12,109)</b>

- The pension deficit has increased to £4,799k from £3,642k following the revaluation process which has been undertaken in accordance with the requirements of FRS 102. See comments in section 4.3.
- A revaluation of assets was undertaken during the prior year which gave rise to a revaluation reserve balance of £4,598k. £190k of this balance has been released to the Income & Expenditure account shown at section 3.5.
- Tangible fixed assets have decreased by £734k principally due to the depreciation charge of £780k in the year.
- Trade and other receivables have decreased by £244k principally due to the receipt of ESF European funding during the year of around £180k.
- Creditors remain in line with the prior year.

	<b>31 July 2016 £'000</b>	<b>31 July 2015 restated £'000</b>
Fixed assets	20,060	20,794
Trade and other receivables	777	1,021
Cash and cash equivalents	597	348
Creditors: amounts falling due in less than one year	(2,643)	(2,507)
Creditors: amounts falling due after more than one year	17,737	18,440
Other provisions	(3,956)	(3,384)
Defined benefit obligations	(4,799)	(3,642)
<b>Net Liabilities</b>	<b>(7,701)</b>	<b>(5,810)</b>
Income & Expenditure reserve	(12,109)	(10,408)
Revaluation Reserve	4,408	4,598
<b>Total Reserves</b>	<b>(7,701)</b>	<b>(5,810)</b>

### 3.7 PRIOR YEAR RESTATEMENT

Following the introduction of the FE/HE SORP 2015, which was implemented for periods beginning on or after 1 January 2015, it was necessary to change the basis on which the College accounts for deferred capital grants and pensions.

The above changes have resulted in a prior year adjustment being made to the numbers as reported at 31 July 2015 and both the total reserves and surplus of the College have been restated as shown below. We are satisfied the restatement has been accounted for correctly and adequately disclosed. Restatement of 2015 net assets & Comprehensive income:

<b>Reconciliation of Financial Position</b>	<b>At 31 July 2015</b>
	<b>£000</b>
Total Reserves as previously stated	10,377
Deferred capital grants	(16,187)
<b>Total Reserves as restated</b>	<b><u>(5,810)</u></b>

<b>Reconciliation of Financial Performance</b>	<b>At 31 July 2015</b>
	<b>£000</b>
Surplus for year as previously stated	76
Unrealised surplus on revaluation of assets	4,598
Change to measurement of net finance cost on defined benefit plans	(281)
Actuarial loss in respect of pension scheme	(18)
<b>Total Comprehensive Income as restated</b>	<b><u>4,375</u></b>

### 3.8 RECONCILIATION OF TOTAL COMPREHENSIVE INCOME TO OPERATING SURPLUS

The table below reconciles the total comprehensive expenditure with the operating surplus achieved in the year. This shows the college is operating within the budgeted resources made available on an annual basis.

	<b>2014/15</b>	<b>2015/16</b>
	<b>16 months</b>	<b>12 months</b>
	<b>£000</b>	<b>£000</b>
<b>Surplus / (Deficit) for the period / year as per statement of comprehensive income and expenditure</b>	<b>4,375</b>	<b>(1,891)</b>
Impact of pension on College – salary costs	378	379
Impact of pension on College – interest	381	256
Actuarial loss in respect of pension schemes	18	1,296
Unrealised surplus on revaluation of assets	(4,598)	-
<b>Surplus for the period / year before adjustments for Net Depreciation Spend</b>	<b>554</b>	<b>40</b>
Loan repayment	-	158
Additional estates spend	-	32
<b>Operating surplus for the period / year</b>	<b><u>554</u></b>	<b><u>230</u></b>

## **4 AUDIT APPROACH & KEY FINDINGS**

### **4.1 OUR APPROACH**

Our audit approach recognises the requirements of the Code and is designed to adhere to the general principles outlined therein. Our approach is also designed to address the requirements of the Financial Memorandum between the Scottish Funding Council (SFC) and the Boards of Governors of the Colleges of Further Education.

Our audit approach is risk based and focused on the key risks facing the College.

During our initial planning procedures, we identified a number of areas where we considered the risk of misstatement in the accounts to be greater than normal. Our audit procedures were designed and undertaken to ensure greater focus on these risk areas in order that specific conclusions could be made with regard to the identified risks. Details of the risks identified, our audit response and our conclusions are included within Appendix D.

As part of our prior year procedures, we documented the systems and controls in place at the College and obtained an understanding of their operation. In accordance with auditing standards during our procedures we reconfirmed our documented understanding of the main operating cycles and associated accounting systems via interviews of staff and the performance of walk through tests. This process has allowed us to review, in the course of our audit, the key elements of the College's systems of internal financial controls in the main operating cycles.

Based on our audit procedures, we are satisfied with the operation of internal financial controls. There are no recommendations to bring to the attention of the Board of Governors.

It should be noted that the primary objective of our audit is to express an opinion on the truth and fairness of the College's accounts as a whole. An audit does not examine every operating activity and accounting procedure in the college, nor does it provide a substitute for management's responsibility to maintain adequate controls over the college's activities. Our work is not designed therefore to provide a comprehensive statement of all weaknesses or inefficiencies that may exist in the colleges systems and working practices, or of all improvements that could be made.

## 4.2 AUDIT ISSUES ARISING

During the course of the audit issues arose which were resolved in discussion with, or formally reported to the Assistant Principal Curriculum, Support and Finance. This practice is an established part of the audit process. This report draws to the attention of the Board of Governors any matters of particular significance or interest, which arose from the audit, noted as follows:

**Accounting Policies:** In accordance with UK GAAP, the Audit Committee has formally reviewed the accounting policies included in the Annual Accounts. There have been changes to the accounting policies in this year following the introduction of FRS102 and the revised FE/HE SORP. We have not identified any instances where we consider the accounting policies to be inappropriate.

**Accountability Report:** Incorporated colleges are required to include an Accountability Report which encompasses a Remuneration and Staff Report within their annual report and accounts. The Remuneration & Staff report sets out required information of senior officials of the College. We have audited the required information contained therein. We have nothing to report in respect of this statement.

**Early retirement provision:** The College has previously given early retirement to staff and makes payments to the pension fund to cover any shortfall arising from the decision to grant access to retirement benefits early. In line with the requirements of Financial Reporting Standard 102 Section 21, the College recognises a liability for the future payments in relation to these early retirements. We have reviewed the College's accounting for these early retirements and found that it complies with the requirements of FRS 102 and that disclosure is consistent with the actuarial report.

The accounting treatment adopted by the College in relation to the pension schemes in place and the early retirement provision is also in accordance with the FE SORP and applicable guidance issued by Audit Scotland.

## 4.3 OTHER MATTERS

- **Pension Fund liabilities:** The College's employees belong to two principal defined benefit pension schemes, the Scottish Teachers' Superannuation Scheme (STSS) for the teaching staff and the Lothian Pension Fund (LPF) for the non-teaching staff. The STSS is a multi-employer, notionally funded scheme and the College is unable to identify its share of the underlying assets and liabilities of the scheme. In line with *Financial Reporting Standard 102 - Retirement Benefits* (Section 34) the College does not recognise any asset or liability relating to the STSS and the scheme is effectively accounted for as if it was a defined contribution scheme.

The LPF is also a multi-employer scheme but the College can identify its share of underlying assets and liabilities and has therefore recognised a net liability in the balance sheet. The College has consistently reported significant FRS 102 liabilities over the past few years. The Lothian Pension Fund's actuaries provide the College with an updated valuation on an annual basis which is reflected in the pensions liability disclosed on the balance sheet. We have reviewed the College's accounting for these pension schemes and found that it complies with the requirements of FRS 102 and that disclosure is consistent with the actuarial report.

**Resource outturn:** The College is required to comply with Government accounting and budgeting rules on a fiscal year basis to the end of March. This requirement is as a result of the reclassification of Colleges as public bodies on 1 April 2014. The resource outturn is disclosed within the College performance report. As part of our audit work we have agreed the revenue resource budget and capital resource budget and associated expenditure against budget to the resource return submitted to the Scottish Funding Council. We have not audited the associated spend against budget, included within the return.

#### 4.4 UNADJUSTED ERRORS

Appendix C includes a copy of the letter of representation which we have sought from the Board of Governors in support of the matters reported to us during our audit procedures. This also includes reference to the summary of unadjusted errors and deviations. There were no errors or deviations that were identified during our procedures other than clearly trifling.

#### 4.5 INDEPENDENCE

International Standard on Auditing (UK and Ireland) 260: Communication with those charged with governance, requires that we communicate at least annually with you regarding all relationships between our firm and West Lothian College which, in our professional judgement, may reasonably be thought to bear on our independence and the objectivity of the audit engagement partner and the audit staff and to detail the related safeguards in place.

We are not aware of any such relationships between our firm and West Lothian College that, in our professional judgement, may reasonably be thought to bear on our independence and the objectivity of the audit engagement partner and the audit staff.

In our professional judgement, as of the date of this report, Wylie & Bisset LLP is independent of West Lothian College within the meaning of United Kingdom regulatory and professional requirements and the objectivity of the audit engagement partner and the audit staff is not impaired.



## **5 GOVERNANCE & INTERNAL CONTROLS**

### **5.1 GOVERNANCE**

Corporate governance is concerned with structures and processes for decision making, accountability, control and behaviour at the upper levels of the organisation. The respective responsibilities of the College and Wylie & Bisset are summarised in appendix A.

Although we are not required to form an opinion on the adequacy and effectiveness of the individual components of the college's code of corporate governance, we are required under the Code to consider the corporate governance arrangements in place at the college.

### **5.2 INTERNAL AUDIT**

Internal audit is a key element of the internal control system set up by management. A strong internal audit function is necessary to ensure the continuing effectiveness of the internal control system established. The College, therefore, needs to have in place a properly resourced internal audit service of good quality. To maximise the reliance that may be placed on internal audit and to avoid duplication of effort, the adequacy of internal audit is assessed each year.

The College's internal auditors during the period ended 31 July 2016 were Scott Moncrieff.

In the course of the academic period 31 July 2016 the following areas were scheduled to be reviewed by the Internal Auditor:

- IT Shared Services
- Business Continuity Planning
- Business Development
- Strategic and Operational Planning
- Financial Ledger and Treasury & Cash Management

Our audit procedures included an assessment of the adequacy of the Internal Audit function and review of the reports issued by the Internal Auditor. At the time of our audit, reporting was complete in relation to the scheduled work to be undertaken and the annual report has been issued.

Minutes of the audit committee were also reviewed.

Our findings in this area proved satisfactory, allowing us to conclude that the internal audit function is operating effectively.

Where relevant, reliance has been placed on the work of internal audit with regards to the work undertaken during our audit process.

### 5.3 STATEMENT OF CORPORATE GOVERNANCE

We have reviewed the Colleges Statement of Corporate Governance included within the financial statements. Whilst we do not express an opinion on this statement, we are required to report where a statement does not comply with the requirements of SORP or other guidance, or if it is misleading or inconsistent with other information of which we are aware. The content of this statement is consistent with our understanding of West Lothian College.

As part of our audit we have performed a limited review and assessment of the College's Corporate Governance systems relating to standards of conduct, openness and integrity. In addition, we reviewed the College's Risk Register and risk management arrangements along with the minutes of meetings of key College committees issued during the year.

The College is committed to exhibiting best practice in all aspects of Corporate Governance and, in the opinion of the Board of Governors the College complies with all the provisions of the UK Corporate Governance Code in so far as they apply to the further education sector.

The College's full Board of Governors meets four times a year and has several committees through which it conducts its business. Each committee has formally constituted terms of reference and standing orders. These committees include: a Finance and General Purposes Committee, an Audit Committee, and a Learning & Teaching Committee. They comprise mainly lay members of the Board, one of whom is the Chair.

Board members also include members from College staff and students.

The Board annually completes an exercise on self-evaluation which is based on the responsibilities of the Board and on the 'Good Governance Standard for Public Services'. Each committee of the Board completes an annual self-evaluation exercise based on the remit of the committee. Both exercises include an evaluation of the performance of the Chair(s).

We have also considered the arrangements made by the college in order to address the requirements of the Bribery Act 2010 that came into force on 1 July 2011 in order to assess their appropriateness and adequacy

Based on our review, we are satisfied that the College operates appropriate Governance procedures and that management has adequate arrangements in place covering standards of conduct.

We found no matters therein to impact upon our audit opinion, and no recommendations have been made in this area to strengthen the Governance arrangements currently in place.

## **6 FRAUD AND IRREGULARITIES**

### **6.1 BEST PRACTICE**

Best practice requires that the College should establish arrangements for the prevention and detection of fraud and other irregularities as part of its Governance procedures.

An assessment was made of the adequacy of the systems and controls for the prevention and detection of fraud and irregularities during our audit planning procedures.

### **6.2 AUDIT FINDINGS**

In the course of the audit we have reviewed the following areas with regard to the prevention and detection of fraud and irregularities:

- a) The monitoring and compliance with financial procedures;
- b) The College's strategy to prevent and detect fraud and other irregularities;
- c) The internal controls operated for segregation of duties, authorisation and approval processes and reconciliation procedures.

No areas of significant concern were found during normal audit procedures.

We emphasise that our audit of the financial statements is planned to ensure there is a reasonable expectation of detecting misstatements arising from fraud or other irregularity that are material in relation to those financial statements, but cannot be relied upon to detect all frauds and irregularities.

Overall we concluded that management has an adequate approach to fraud prevention and detection and has reasonable controls in place to ensure that potential areas for fraud are detected and dealt with in an appropriate manner.

There are no specific recommendations made in this area.

## 7 AUDIT RECOMMENDATIONS – 31 JULY 2015

### 7.1 PRIOR PERIOD MANAGEMENT LETTER

A management letter was prepared by Wylie & Bisset LLP in relation to the accounts of West Lothian College for the period ended 31 July 2015.

The points noted within the prior year management letter, along with the observations and follow up conclusions from the current year are detailed below.

The points within the report have been assigned a priority level based on the urgency required in addressing the matters highlighted. An explanation of the priority is as follows:

**High Priority** - Recommendations addressing significant control weaknesses which should be implemented immediately.

**Medium Priority** - Recommendations addressing significant control weaknesses which should be addressed in the medium term.

**Low Priority** - Recommendations which, although not addressing significant weaknesses, would either improve efficiency or ensure that the company matches current best practice.

7.2	European Claims Debtor
Observation	The debtor for European Claims remains outstanding at 31 March 2014 with no amounts having been received for a significant period of time and no work having been undertaken to pursue this debt.
Implication	There is a risk that the debtor could be irrecoverable if it is not actively pursued.
Recommendation	We recognise that the College is not the lead partner on these projects however we recommend that the College begins to actively pursue the debt through the lead partner in order to receive the monies owed as soon as possible.
Priority	<b>Low</b>
Management Response	Agreed
2015 Update	Communication with the lead partner of this project is ongoing and the debtor is believed to be recoverable but is still outstanding at this time. Payment is expected at the end of 2015. <b>We repeat the original recommendation.</b>
2016	We noted this money was received during the year. <b>No further action required.</b>

## 8 AUDIT RECOMMENDATIONS – CURRENT PERIOD

### 8.1 PRIOR YEAR RECOMMENDATIONS CARRIED FORWARD

As noted within the previous section, there were recommendations arising from the previous audit which have not yet been resolved. These have been repeated here for ease of reference.

8.2	European Claims Debtor
Observation	The debtor for European Claims remains outstanding at 31 March 2014 with no amounts having been received for a significant period of time and no work having been undertaken to pursue this debt.
Implication	There is a risk that the debtor could be irrecoverable if it is not actively pursued.
Recommendation	We recognise that the College is not the lead partner on these projects however we recommend that the College begins to actively pursue the debt through the lead partner in order to receive the monies owed as soon as possible.
Priority	<b>Low</b>
Management Response	Agreed
2015 Update	Communication with the lead partner of this project is ongoing and the debtor is believed to be recoverable but is still outstanding at this time. Payment is expected at the end of 2015. <b>We repeat the original recommendation.</b>
2016	We noted this money was received during the year. <b>No further action required.</b>

## **8.2 CURRENT PERIOD RECOMMENDATIONS**

There are no matters to be brought to the Board's attention following completion of this year's audit process.

## APPENDICES



## **A BOARD OF GOVERNORS' RESPONSIBILITIES**

The Board of Governors are required to present audited financial statements for each financial year.

In accordance with the Further and Higher Education (Scotland) Act 1992 as amended by the Further & Higher Education (Scotland) Act 2005 and subsequently by the Post-16 Education (Scotland) Act 2013, the Board of Governors is responsible for the administration and management of the College's affairs, including ensuring an effective system of internal control, and is required to present audited financial statements for each financial year.

The Board of Governors is responsible for keeping proper accounting records which disclose, with reasonable accuracy at any time, the financial position of the College and enable it to ensure that the financial statements are prepared in accordance with the Further and Higher Education (Scotland) Act 1992 as amended by the Further & Higher Education (Scotland) Act 2005 and subsequently amended by the Post-16 Education (Scotland) Act 2013, the 2015 Statement of Recommended Practice - Accounting for Further and Higher Education, the Government Financial Reporting Manual 2015-16 (FReM) where applicable and other relevant accounting standards. In addition, within the terms and conditions of a Financial Memorandum agreed between the Scottish Funding Council and the College's Board of Governors, the Board of Governors, through its designated office holder, is required to prepare financial statements for each financial year which give a true and fair view of the College's state of affairs and of the surplus or deficit and cash flows for that year.

The financial statements are prepared in accordance with the Accounts Direction issued by the Scottish Funding Council which brings together the provisions of the Financial Memorandum with other formal disclosures that the Scottish Funding Council require the Board of Governors to make in the financial statements and related notes.

In preparing the financial statements, the Board of Governors is required to:

- Select suitable accounting policies and apply them consistently;
- Make judgements and estimates that are reasonable and prudent;
- State whether applicable Accounting Standards have been followed, subject to any material departures disclosed and explained in the financial statements;
- Prepare financial statements on the going concern basis, unless it is inappropriate to presume that the College will continue in operation. The Board of Governors is satisfied that it has adequate resources to continue in operation for the foreseeable future and for this reason the going concern basis continues to be adopted in the preparation of the financial statements.

The Board of Governors has taken reasonable steps to:

- Ensure that funds from the Scottish Funding Council are used only for the purposes for which they have been given and in accordance with the Financial Memorandum with the Funding Council and any other conditions which the Funding Council may from time to time prescribe;
- Ensure that there are appropriate financial and management controls in place to safeguard public funds and funds from other sources;
- Safeguard the assets of the College and prevent and detect fraud;
- Secure the economical, efficient and effective management of the College's resources and expenditure.

The key elements of the College's system of internal financial control, which is designed to discharge the responsibilities set out above, include the following:

- Clear definitions of the responsibilities of, and the authority delegated to, heads of academic and support departments;
- A comprehensive medium and short-term planning process, supplemented by detailed annual income, expenditure, capital and cash flow budgets;
- Regular reviews of key performance indicators and business risks and quarterly reviews of financial results involving variance reporting and updates of forecast outturns;
- Clearly defined and formalised requirements for approval and control of expenditure, with investment decisions involving capital or revenue expenditure being subject to formal detailed appraisal and review according to approval levels set by the Board of Governors;
- Comprehensive Financial Regulations, detailing financial controls and procedures, approved by the Audit Committee and the Finance and General Purposes Committee;
- Professional internal audit team whose annual programme is approved by the Audit Committee and endorsed by the Board of Governors and whose head provides the Board of Governors with a report on internal audit activity within the College and an opinion on the adequacy and effectiveness of the College's system of internal control, including internal financial control.

Any system of internal financial control can, however, only provide reasonable, but not absolute, assurance against material misstatement or loss.

## **B INDEPENDENT AUDITOR'S REPORT**

### **Independent auditor's report to the members of the Board of Governors of West Lothian College, the Auditor General for Scotland and the Scottish Parliament**

We have audited the financial statements of West Lothian College for the year ended 31 July 2016 under the Further and Higher Education (Scotland) Act 1992 and section 44(1)(c) of the Charities and Trustee Investment (Scotland) Act 2005. The financial statements comprise the Statement of Comprehensive Income, Statement of Changes in Reserves, Balance Sheet, and Statement of Cash Flow and the related notes. The financial reporting framework that has been applied in their preparation is applicable law and United Kingdom Financial Reporting Standard (United Kingdom Generally Accepted Accounting Practice).

This report is made solely to the parties to whom it is addressed in accordance with the Public Finance and Accountability (Scotland) Act 2000 and for no other purpose. In accordance with paragraph 125 of the Code of Audit Practice approved by the Auditor General for Scotland, we do not undertake to have responsibilities to members or officers, in their individual capacities, or to third parties.

### **Respective responsibilities of the Board of Governors and auditor**

As explained more fully in the Statement of Board of Governors' Responsibilities, the Board of Governors is responsible for the preparation of the financial statements and for being satisfied that they give a true and fair view, and is also responsible for ensuring the regularity of expenditure and income. Our responsibility is to audit and express an opinion on the financial statements in accordance with applicable law and International Standards on Auditing (UK and Ireland) as required by the Code of Audit Practice approved by the Auditor General for Scotland. Those standards require us to comply with the Auditing Practices Board's Ethical Standards for Auditors. We are also responsible for giving an opinion on the regularity of expenditure and income in accordance with the Public Finance and Accountability (Scotland) Act 2000.

### **Scope of the audit of the financial statements**

An audit involves obtaining evidence about the amounts and disclosures in the financial statements sufficient to give reasonable assurance that the financial statements are free from material misstatement, whether caused by fraud or error. This includes an assessment of: whether the accounting policies are appropriate to the college's circumstances and have been consistently applied and adequately disclosed; the reasonableness of significant accounting estimates made by the Board of Governors; and the overall presentation of the financial statements.

It also involves obtaining evidence about the regularity of expenditure and income. In addition, we read all the financial and non-financial information in the report and financial statements to identify material inconsistencies with the audited financial statements and to identify any information that is apparently materially incorrect based on, or materially inconsistent with, the knowledge acquired by us in the course of performing the audit. If we become aware of any apparent material misstatements, irregularities, or inconsistencies we consider the implications for our report.

### **Opinion on financial statements**

In our opinion the financial statements:

- give a true and fair view in accordance with the Further and Higher Education (Scotland) Act 1992 and directions made thereunder by the Scottish Funding Council of the state of the college's affairs as at 31 July 2016 and of its deficit for the year then ended;
- have been properly prepared in accordance with United Kingdom Generally Accepted Accounting Practice; and
- have been prepared in accordance with the requirements of the Further and Higher Education (Scotland) Act 1992 and directions made thereunder by the Scottish Funding Council, the Charities and Trustee Investment (Scotland) Act 2005, and regulation 14 of The Charities Accounts (Scotland) Regulations 2006 (as amended).

### **Opinion on regularity**

In our opinion in all material respects the expenditure and income in the financial statements were incurred or applied in accordance with any applicable enactments and guidance issued by the Scottish Ministers.

### **Opinion on other prescribed matters**

In our opinion:

- the part of the Remuneration and Staff Report to be audited has been properly prepared in accordance with the Further and Higher Education (Scotland) Act 1992 and directions made thereunder by the Scottish Ministers; and
- the information given in the Performance Report for the financial year for which the financial statements are prepared is consistent with the financial statements.

**Matters on which we are required to report by exception**

We are required to report to you if, in our opinion:

- proper accounting records have not been kept; or
- the financial statements and the part of the Remuneration and Staff Report to be audited are not in agreement with the accounting records; or
- we have not received all the information and explanations we require for our audit; or
- the corporate governance statement does not comply with Scottish Funding Council requirements.

We have nothing to report in respect of these matters.

Ross McLauchlan BAcc CA, for and on behalf of Wylie & Bisset LLP

168 Bath Street

Glasgow

G2 4TP

Wylie & Bisset LLP is eligible to act as an auditor in terms of section 1212 of the Companies Act 2006

## **C LETTER OF REPRESENTATION**

Dear Sirs

### **LETTER OF REPRESENTATION**

We confirm to the best of our knowledge and belief the following representations given to you in connection with your audit of the college's accounts for the period ended 31<sup>st</sup> July 2016.

1. We acknowledge as members of the Board of Governors our responsibility for ensuring:
  - a) the financial statements are free of material misstatements including omissions
  - b) that the financial statements give a true and fair view of the state of affairs of the College as at 31<sup>st</sup> July 2016.
  - c) all the accounting records have been made available to you for the purpose of your audit and all the transactions undertaken by the College have been properly reflected and recorded in the accounting records.
  - d) all other records and related information, including minutes of all management meetings, have been made available to you.
  - e) the accounting policies used are detailed in the financial statements and are consistent with those adopted in the previous financial statements and are in accordance with the Accounts Direction issued by SFC under the terms of the Further and Higher Education (Scotland) Act 1992, and
  - f) compliance with the terms and conditions of the Financial Memorandum issued to the Board of Governors by the SFC.
2. Scott Moncrieff act as Internal Auditors to the College. All reports issued to the College and our responses to them have been made available to you
3. We acknowledge our responsibility for the design and implementation of internal control systems to prevent and detect fraud. We have disclosed to you the results of our risk assessment that the financial statements may be misstated as a result of fraud. There have been no

irregularities (or allegations of irregularities) involving management, employees who have a significant role in internal control or others that could have a material effect on the financial statements.

4. The College has no liabilities or contingent liabilities other than those disclosed in the accounts.
5. All claims in connection with litigation that have been, or are expected to be, received have been properly accrued for in the financial statements.
6. There have been no events since the balance sheet date that require disclosure or which would materially affect the amounts in the accounts, other than those already disclosed or included in the accounts. Should further material events occur, which may necessitate revision of the figures included in the financial statements or inclusion of a note thereto, we will advise you accordingly.
7. The College has had at no time during the year any arrangement, transaction or agreement to provide credit facilities (including loans, quasi-loans or credit transactions) for the Board of Governors nor to guarantee or provide security for such matters.
8. We confirm that we have disclosed to you all related party transactions relevant to the College and that we are not aware of any further related party matters that require disclosure in order to comply with the requirements of charities legislation, the Statement of Recommended Practice for Further and Higher Education accounts or accounting standards.
9. The College has not contracted for any capital expenditure other than as disclosed in the accounts.
10. The College has satisfactory title to all assets and there are no liens or encumbrances on the College's assets, except for those that are disclosed in the financial statements.
11. We are not aware of any irregularities, including fraud, involving existing management or employees of the College, nor are we aware of any breaches or possible breaches of statute, regulations, contracts, agreements or College's Constitution and Articles of Government which might result in the College suffering significant penalties or other loss. No allegations of such irregularities, including fraud, or such breaches have come to our attention.
12. We confirm that we are not aware of any possible or actual instance of non-compliance with those laws and regulations which provide a legal framework within which the College conducts its business.

13. We confirm that the revenue resource budget for 2015/16 was £17,050k and the resource outturn expenditure was £17,050k, and that the capital resource budget was (CDEL) £192k and the resource outturn expenditure was £192k.
14. We confirm that, in our opinion, the College is a going concern on the grounds that current and future sources of funding or support will be more than adequate for the College's needs. We have considered a period of twelve months from the date of approval of the financial statements. We believe that no further disclosures relating to the College's ability to continue as a going concern need to be made in the financial statements.
15. We confirm that no journal adjustments have been processed in drafting the statutory accounts.

We confirm that the above representations are made on the basis of enquiries of management and staff with relevant knowledge and experience (and, where appropriate, of supporting documentation) sufficient to satisfy ourselves that we can properly make each of the above representations to you.

Yours faithfully

..... Chairman      ..... Principal & Chief Executive



## D IDENTIFIED AUDIT RISKS, APPROACH AND CONCLUSION

Risk	Audit response	Conclusion
<p><b>Override of Internal controls</b></p> <p>Fraud or error arising due to management override of controls. Note that this is considered a specific risk for all audit engagements in accordance with the requirements of ISAs.</p>	<p>Our audit procedures will include testing the appropriateness of journal entries recorded within the general ledger and other adjustments made in the preparation of the financial statements, along with a review of accounting estimates for any evidence of bias. We will also consider specifically any significant transactions outside the normal operations of the College.</p>	<p>Satisfactory. Our testing has highlighted no issues in this area. There are no indicators of inappropriate management override of controls.</p>
<p><b>Revenue recognition</b></p> <p>Material misstatement due to errors in revenue recognition. Note that this is considered a specific risk for all audit engagements in accordance with the requirements of ISAs unless it can be specifically rebutted.</p>	<p>Our standard testing procedures in this area will adequately address the associated risk such that a specific additional audit response is not required.</p>	<p>Satisfactory. Our testing of the income balances has highlighted no issues with regard to revenue recognition providing adequate assurance over the figures included within the financial statements.</p>

Risk	Audit response	Conclusion
<p><b>Financial performance</b></p> <p>The level of Scottish Government funding available to the College is tight resulting in it being difficult to generate a surplus. There is therefore an increased risk with regards to our audit to ensure transactions are reported correctly. The risks associated with reporting a surplus will become even greater in future years with the reclassification of the college as a non-departmental public body (NDPB) meaning reported surpluses may be transferred to a separate charitable foundation in future years.</p>	<p>As part of our audit process we will review the College's final outturn and ensure we can adequately explain any deviations from budget. Any non-standard transactions will be specifically reviewed as part of our audit testing to confirm adherence with the requirements of the relevant accounting standard. In particular, any severance provision will be assessed to ensure they meet the criteria to be booked as a provision at the balance sheet date.</p>	<p>We are satisfied that the procedures and processes operated by the College in this area are adequate to meet the needs of the College in a time of tight resources.</p> <p>All significant deviations from budget have been adequately explained and supported.</p> <p>We are satisfied that non-standard transactions have been processed correctly.</p>

## E CONTACT DETAILS

Name	Position	Email
Ross McLauchlan	Audit Partner	<a href="mailto:ross.mclauchlan@wyliebisset.com">ross.mclauchlan@wyliebisset.com</a>
Scott Gillon	Partner, Engagement Manager	<a href="mailto:scott.gillon@wyliebisset.com">scott.gillon@wyliebisset.com</a>
Martin Grindlay	Audit Senior	<a href="mailto:martin.grindlay@wyliebisset.com">martin.grindlay@wyliebisset.com</a>

### **Wylie & Bisset LLP**

168 Bath Street

Glasgow

G2 4TP

Tel: 0141 566 7000

Fax: 0141 566 7001